

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

MONDAY, 10TH SEPTEMBER 2007, AT 2.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors E. C. Tibby (Chairman), Mrs. J. M. Boswell,
Mrs. J. Dyer M.B.E., D. Hancox, B. Lewis F.CMI, Mrs. J. D. Luck,
E. J. Murray, S. R. Peters, C. R. Scurrall and C. J. K. Wilson

Observers: Councillor Mrs. R. L. Dent, Councillor R. Hollingworth and
Councillor P. M. McDonald

Officers: Mrs. D. Warren, Mr. D. M. Birch, Mrs. S. Willetts and
Mr. A. C. Stephens

61/07 **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

An apology for absence was received from Councillor G. N. Denaro.

62/07 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations of interest were received.

63/07 **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting of the Planning Committee held on 13th August 2007 were submitted.

RESOLVED that, with the inclusion of Councillor D. L. Pardoe (substituting for Councillor Mrs. J. D. Luck) in the list of Members present at the meeting, the minutes be approved as a correct record.

64/07 **B/2007/0306-SW - SUSTAINABLE AFFORDABLE HOUSING (OUTLINE) - LAND AT HINTON FIELDS (OFF DALE CLOSE) CATSHILL, BROMSGROVE - BROMFORD HOUSING GROUP**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services drew Members' attention to the Article 3 Direction whereby the matters requested in detail were scale, layout and appearance. He stated that the details received were not indicative, but represented the proposed detailed scheme for consideration.

The receipt of a further objection was also reported.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr. D. B. Balsom addressed the Committee and spoke in opposition to the application, whilst Mr. M. Bridge, on behalf of the applicant, spoke in favour of the application.

RESOLVED that permission be refused for the following reasons:-

1. The application site falls within Green Belt as designated within the Bromsgrove District Local Plan. The scheme for 19 affordable dwellings represents inappropriate development in the Green Belt that would harm the openness of the Green Belt and prejudice the purposes of Green Belt policy. The very special circumstances submitted to justify the setting aside of inappropriate development in the Green Belt do not outweigh the harm caused. As such, the proposal is contrary to policy QE1 of the West Midlands Spatial Strategy, policies D.8, D.12, D.39 and SD.7 of the Worcestershire County Structure Plan, policies DS2, DS13, S9 and S16 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan, and the provisions of PPG2 and PPS3.
2. The layout and scale of the development responds poorly to both the local context of the area or having a positive impact on its character. The land contours of the site are not appreciated in the submission, leading to an inaccurate portrayal of the elevations and layout of the scheme. The proposal is contrary to policy QE3 of the Regional Spatial Strategy (RSS), policies CTC.1 and CTC.5 of the Worcester County Structure Plan, policy DS13 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan, the guidance in Supplementary Guidance Note 1 and national policy guidance contained in PPS1 'Delivering Sustainable Development' and PPS3 'Housing'.

65/07 **B/2007/0482-LD - RETROSPECTIVE FENCED CAR PARK AREA - WINDMILL HOUSE, WEATHEROAK HILL, ALVECHURCH - BETEL OF BRITAIN**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported that the application for planning permission had been withdrawn.

RESOLVED that the Head of Planning and Environment Services, in consultation with the Head of Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services, be authorised to proceed with the most appropriate course of enforcement action to remedy the breach of planning control referred to in the report.

66/07 **B/2007/0495-DMB - ERECTION OF 20 AFFORDABLE DWELLINGS - LAND OFF ASH LANE AND SMEDLEY CROOKE PLACE, HOPWOOD, ALVECHURCH - BROMSGROVE DISTRICT HOUSING TRUST**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported the receipt of comments from the Environment Agency, the Housing Standards Officer, the Strategic Planning Manager and Alvechurch Parish Council, together with the receipt of additional correspondence from the applicant's Agent. He also stated that an additional letter had been received in relation to wildlife issues, as detailed under the Ecological and Biodiversity Issues section of the report.

Consideration was given to this application which had been recommended for refusal by the Director of Planning Services.

On the matter being put to the vote it was decided that permission be granted because Members considered that the need and requirement for affordable housing in Hopwood constituted very special circumstances which outweighed the harm that would be caused to the openness of the Green Belt and the purposes of including land within the Green Belt, and other harm.

RESOLVED:

- (a) that permission be granted subject to appropriate conditions and notes which are considered necessary by the Head of Planning and Environment Services and the applicant entering into a suitable legal mechanism in relation to monetary contributions in respect of highway improvement works; and
- (b) that the application be referred to the Government Office for the West Midlands under the "departure" procedure.

67/07 **B/2007/0594-SMCN - PAVEMENT BARRIERS, 2 SETS OF LETTERS, 2 POSTER CASES AND 1 RETRACTABLE AWNING (ADVERTISEMENT CONSENT) - 126-130 HIGH STREET, BROMSGROVE - THE LAUREL PUB COMPANY**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported that the application had been brought before the Committee for consideration at the request of Councillor Mrs. R. L. Dent.

Consideration was then given to the application which had been recommended for approval by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

However, Members considered that some aspects of the proposal, namely the pavement barriers and retractable awning, would be detrimental to the visual amenities of the locality and the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. Members felt that this part of the proposal would also have a significant and detrimental impact on the special historic and architectural significance of the Listed Building.

RESOLVED:

- (a) that advertisement consent be granted for the two sets of letters and two poster cases subject to the following conditions, and the notes set out on pages 56 and 57 of the report:
 - 1. The underside of any projection or sign hereby approved shall be positioned not less than 2.4 metres above the level of the adjoining footway / verge; and
 - 2. No light source shall be visible from outside the extremities of the application site or produce more than 2 Lux horizontal or vertical illuminance at any adjacent property boundary. (Note: 1 Lux if property is residential and has windows at boundary).
- (b) that advertisement consent be refused for the pavement barriers and retractable awning for the following reason:

1. The pavement barriers and retractable awning are considered to be detrimental to the visual amenities of the locality and the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, contrary to policy S27b and criteria (a) of policy S35a of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan. This proposal would have a significant and detrimental impact on the special historic and architectural significance of the Listed Building, contrary to policy S39 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan, policies CTC.19 and CTC.20 of the Worcestershire County Structure Plan, the guidance contained in SPG2 and the provisions of PPG15 and PPG19.

68/07 **B/2007/0767-SMCN - TABLES AND CHAIRS TO FRONT OF BUILDING - 126-130 HIGH STREET, BROMSGROVE - THE LAUREL PUB COMPANY**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported that the application had been brought before the Committee for consideration at the request of Councillor Mrs. R. L. Dent.

The comments of the West Mercia Constabulary, the Community Safety Officer and the Economic Development Officer were also reported.

Consideration was then given to the application which had been recommended for approval by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

However, Members considered that the proposal will encourage disorderly behaviour and increase the fear of crime for those pedestrians in the High Street.

RESOLVED that permission be refused for the following reason:

1. The proposal will encourage disorderly behaviour and increase the fear of crime for those pedestrians in the High Street contrary to policy D.43 of the Worcestershire County Structure Plan.

69/07 **B/2007/0768-SMCN - PROVIDE NEW CANOPY TO FRONT ELEVATION OF SITE - 126-130 HIGH STREET, BROMSGROVE - LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - THE LAUREL PUB COMPANY**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported that the application had been brought before the Committee for consideration at the request of Councillor Mrs. R. L. Dent.

Consideration was then given to the application which had been recommended for approval by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

However, Members considered that the proposal, by virtue of its scale and appearance, would have a significant and detrimental impact on the special historic and architectural significance of the Listed Building.

RESOLVED that permission be refused for the following reason:

1. The proposal, by virtue of its scale and appearance, would have a significant and detrimental impact on the special historic and architectural significance of the Listed Building, contrary to policy S39 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan, policy CTC.19 of the Worcestershire County Structure Plan, the guidance contained in SPG2 and the provisions of PPG15 and PPG19.

70/07 **B/2007/0611-LD - TWO-STOREY SIDE EXTENSION - 6A BLAKES FIELD DRIVE, BARNT GREEN - MR. P. GROVE**

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mrs. H. Lanigan addressed the Committee and spoke in opposition to the application, whilst Mr. P. Grove, the applicant, spoke in favour.

Consideration was then given to the application which had been recommended for approval by the Head of Planning and Environment Services. However, Members considered that the proposal would be overbearing and out of balance with the current development. In addition, Members considered the scheme originally approved under Plan Ref. B/2006/0159 to represent the best scheme of development for the site.

RESOLVED that permission be refused for the following reason:

1. The proposal is considered to be overbearing and out of balance with the current development contrary to policies S10 and DS13 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan, policy SD.2 of the Worcestershire County Structure Plan, the provisions of SPG1 and 'good design' as advocated by PPS1.

71/07 **B/2007/0663-DI - DEMOLITION OF EXISTING DWELLING AND ERECTION OF NEW DWELLING AND DETACHED 3 CAR GARAGE - WOODCOTE GREEN FARM, WOODCOTE LANE, UPTON WARREN, BROMSGROVE - MR. J. DALMAN**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services clarified issues concerning the residential curtilage area of, and proposed access driveway to, the application site.

Consideration was given to this application which had been recommended for refusal by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

On the matter being put to the vote, Members considered that permission should be granted because of the increased openness of the Green Belt, through the removal of the existing buildings and the resultant less intrusive development, which constituted very special circumstances to outweigh the harm that would be caused to the openness of the Green Belt and the purposes of including land within the Green Belt.

RESOLVED that permission be granted subject to appropriate conditions and notes which are considered necessary by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

72/07 **B/2007/0704-DMB - NEW INDUSTRIAL UNITS FOR B1, B2 AND B8 USE - LAND AT SUGARBROOK MILL, BUNTSFORD PARK ROAD, BROMSGROVE - D. C. LAMBE LTD.**

RESOLVED that permission be granted subject to the conditions and notes set out or referred to on pages 73 to 79 of the report.

73/07 **B/2007/0717-DI - REAR EXTENSION TO ENHANCE SPECIALISED DEMENTIA CARE ACCOMMODATION AND MEET LATEST CARE STANDARDS ACT REQUIREMENTS - 656 BIRMINGHAM ROAD, BROMSGROVE - WORCESTERSHIRE CARE GROUP**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported the receipt of additional correspondence, together with photographs showing the boundary with the adjacent property, from the applicant's Agent.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr. C. Butterworth addressed the Committee and spoke in opposition to the proposals, whilst Mr. S. Ewin, the applicant, spoke in favour.

Consideration was given to this application which had been recommended for refusal by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

On the matter being put to the vote, Members considered that the need to provide care for the elderly constituted very special circumstances which outweighed the harm that would be caused to the openness of the Green Belt and the purposes of including land within the Green Belt. Furthermore, Members considered that the development would have limited harm on the residential amenities of the adjacent occupier.

RESOLVED that permission be granted subject to appropriate conditions and notes which are considered necessary by the Head of Planning and Environment Services.

74/07 **B/2007/0759-VN - NEW 1800 MM HIGH BOUNDARY FENCE - 47 LINTHURST ROAD, BARNT GREEN - MR. S. NASH**

The Head of Planning and Environment Services reported the receipt of a further letter of objection from Barnt Green Parish Council.

RESOLVED that permission be granted.

(NOTE: Under section 4, paragraph 16.7 of the Council's Constitution, Councillor C. R. Scurrrell requested that it be recorded that he had voted against the resolution.)

75/07 **B/2007/0809-DMB - SINGLE STOREY REAR EXTENSION - DAVID LLOYD
FITNESS CENTRE, SLIDESLOW DRIVE, BROMSGROVE - DAVID LLOYD
FITNESS CENTRE**

RESOLVED that authority to determine the application be delegated to the Head of Planning and Environment Services upon the expiry of the publicity period on 13th September 2007, subject to appropriate conditions and notes.

76/07 **APPEAL DECISIONS**

Members considered a report which detailed the decisions of planning appeals which had been determined since the last meeting of the Committee.

RESOLVED that the report be noted.

The meeting closed at 5.00 pm

Chairman